**Transcript of group** interview with Abda, Hilary, Sam and Yaling, 15th November 2019*(these are all pseudonyms)*

The researcher’s speeches, actions and summaries are in roman text, the interviewees’ speeches are in italics.

I recap all the workshops. Then I show them their (anonymised) answers to the pre-course task.

The question and answers (now anonymised on the slide) are:

1. What is critical thinking?

This is what you said before the course.

*To think following the rules of logic …* [Sam]

*Question other people's ideas* [Hilary]

*Thinking in different way and find alternative solution for each problem* [Abda]

Yaling joined the group at the last minute to replace another prospective interviewee who was absent, so I didn’t have her response from the PCT on the screen:

*Think in different ways* [Yaling]

Then I showed them this question, which I invited them to discuss in groups:

1. Has your definition of critical thinking changed? How?

Yaling [to Sam]: *What’s your initial thinking?*

Sam: *I think it’s, critical thinking is about thinking in a logical way, like maybe find some drawback of their prove, or ... but now I think critical thinking is about avoid* [Yaling: *thinking in, thinking independent*] *avoid bias* or [Yaling*: avoid bias*] *or focus on the fact not influence by your emotion or others or your stand or* [Yaling: mmm] *or this kind of thing*.

Yaling: *Use your logic, not your emotion…?*

Sam: *Mmm, I think it’s more about avoid* [Yaling: *to make the decisions*?] *avoid the influence by your instinct, or something like that, like framing … It’s, uh -*

Yaling: *Did that change?*

Sam: *Yes, change, because …*

Yaling: *I think that is the logic*

Sam: *I mean in my mind it’s kind of different, because its, we’re like, I mean before I think it’s more like, find something that’s missing or wrong in prove process, but now it’s more focus on the not affected by* [Yaling: *mmm*] *by your position.*

Yaling: *Judge by the in fact, do not trust your instinct.*

Sam: *Yes. It’s the different aspect, I think.*

Yaling: [nodding thoughtfully] *Mmmm.*

Hilary [to Abda]: How about you?

Abda: *Before I come to the course, I was thinking critical thinking is related to the study only, of the university* [general murmurs of agreement]. *So I was thinking that’s just for our* [unclear: *university?*], *and how we study. But then now, I realise critical thinking is related to all our life also* [general nodding], *so how to judge, how to choose which is better for you, of course with the study. So I think now I have deep understanding about the critical thinking.*

Hilary: *Yeah, I think at first I have idea about critical thinking is have spectacle [sceptical?] way to think something. But I think now I have almost the same on the essential points in that, you should criticise, or you should question some points in our life. But I think I have some ideas to support my critical thinking, because I know we should recognise from all kinds of aspects in our life* [Yaling: *Yes*; general nodding], *not only just criticise it, or not only just question that. We should think about many situations, many aspects, like different things we should think that in* [Abda: *different ways*] *yeah, in deep understanding, not only on the surface to think about that.*  [Abda: unclear], *yes, yes!* [Abda: *exactly]. So that is a good way to help me to build up full aspects* [Sam: *yes, yes*] *thinking about critical, yeah, criticise something.*

Abda: *Also, another point* [unclear: *applying here*?] *we have to accept facts, even if against our belief and our what we think*

Sam: *We should be open-minded*

Abda: *Yeah, exactly, we should accept everything* [general murmuring and nodding in agreement] *that should be fact.*

Yaling: *We should discard the bias, bias*

Abda: *Confirmation bias, yeah*.

Sam: *It’s like, don’t just look something in your angle. You should go around and …* [describes a circle with his finger

Yaling: *Yes, go around ... like, much more open-minded*

Abda: *Exactly, yeah.*

Hilary: *Yes, from all aspects, I think this is what I learned most important for me. Yes, yeah. I didn’t know something about fra-*

Abda: *Framing, framing*

Hilary: *Framing, framing before. yeah. I also didn’t think about my emotion can influence some critical thinking, yeah.* [Abda and Sam nod].

Abda: *Yeah.*

1. and 4. Students seem to have finished talking on this point and look at me expectantly for the next question. I show them this (below), and emphasize that although they may feel they have already covered this, it is actually a different question.

Has your own thinking changed as a result of this course?

If so, how?

What caused this change, do you think?

Sam and Yaling say they have already talked about that.

Yaling: *We need to, like …*

Sam: *… accept more opinions, or …*

Hilary: *I think critical thinking is also has an important thing, that is not only think yourself, but also think others’ feelings* [Abda and Sam nod], *so I think if you combine this kind of knowledge, you can get a more fire* [*fair*] *charge* [*judge*?]. [Sam looks confused]. *You can get some results more fire* [*fair*].

Sam: *Oh, “fair, fair”, yes*.

Hilary: *Fire* [*fair*], *yeah.*

Abda: *Also, some point, if I’m for example, if I’m not in favour of some what people think and what they are doing, but after this course, I could be able to understand that thing, with justification, so I should understand why they do that* [general strong agreement]

The following indented exchanges all overlap:

Yaling: *We can make understanding*

Abda: *So don’t judge people. Don’t judge people*

Hilary: *Yes*

Yaling: *We can make understanding of what they are thinking, and what they behave*

 Abda: *Yes, we have to understand*

Abda: *Yeah. So because they didn’t just, uh* [looks for words]

The following indented exchanges all overlap:

Abda*: Justified*

Sam: *To have an understanding, different situations*

Yaling: *In their situation, their own situation, they have to*

Abda: *They have the reasons, they have the reasons to do that*.

Abda: *So we have to understand the reasons, and why they do that.*

Hilary: *Yeah, I agree with you*

Sam: *Maybe we should just accept the difference between people* [unclear] [Abda: *exactly*] *and not just thinking, why don’t they do as you do.* [General agreement]

Hilary: *Yeah, that is culture, maybe*

Yaling: *Yes. Like, I used to judge people by myself, by my own rules, like why they are not doing like that, why they are did that …*

Sam: *Why don’t they like our dishes?* [General laughter]

The following indented exchanges overlap:

Yaling: *I think it’s the culture, the culture [everyone murmuring at once]. I think that really influence me very much.*

Abda: *Yeah, people have reasons to do something*

Abda: *Yeah, yeah. So we have to understand the reasons, what they did that. Sometimes when you listen to the reasons, ah, you will be persuaded!*

Yaling: *Try to understand* [general murmurs of agreement]

Abda: *Exactly, exactly*.

Sam: *But sometimes you don’t. But, you should*.

The following indented exchanges overlap:

Abda: *But you understand*

Yaling*: It’s not that easy*

The following indented exchanges overlap:

Sam: *You should understand*

Abda: *You shouldn’t be persuaded, but you should understand what they did and respect* [general agreement]

I point out the next question: What caused this change? There is some confusion, then I explain I’m asking if there is any particular workshop or activity that influenced them.

Abda: *The workshop it was that influenced me and I understand everything in there and it was very useful. I think it was the confirmation bias* [the others nod and murmur agreement]. *Yeah, it was very useful so I understand many things there and I think about it. So it was very useful.*

Yaling: *I think it’s the – framing? Workshop 3?*

Abda: *Exactly. Framing, yeah. That was the other one.*

Yaling: *We think in the way we want to think.*

Abda: *We don’t want to see what others think about it* [Yaling draws a rectangle like a picture frame in the air]

Sam: *Yes. Yes*.

Yaling: *We have a frame. Of our – mind* [general agreement]. *Of our thinking*.

Sam: *That course influence me a lot about the thinking ways. And also try to dis[ap]prove your opinion, yes*.

Yaling: *Yes*

Sam: It’s important.

Yaling: *It’s workshop 2?*

Sam: *No, it’s framing*.

Yaling: *Framing?*

The following indented exchanges overlap:

Sam: *After workshop 3 there’s the homework*

Yaling: *Cherry pick – cherry picking*.

Sam: *Cherry picking?*

Hilary: *I forgot …*

Yaling: *We always pick the cherry we like* [light dawns around the table as students remember]

Abda: *Cherry tomato*

Sam: *Cherry tomato?*

There is some discussion on the meaning of “cherry” until I show them a picture of one on the slide. All laugh.

Hilary: *Every courses give some different kind of guidance. It help you get more informant about critical thinking in your life* [general murmurs of agreement]. *Yeah. I remember that maths question. I think that is very funny way to tell you something.*

Sam: *Mm?*

Hilary: *Maths question? 2, 4, 8 …* [students all remember]

The following indented exchanges overlap:

Yaling: *Ah, yes. Yes, it’s really, it’s really shock*

Sam: *You should dis[ap]prove your*

Hilary: *Ah, yeah, yeah*

Yaling: *It’s shocking*

Sam: *Instinct idea*. [Hilary. Yeah. Yes] *And try to find what is the truth.*

Hilary: *Yes, you should find the*

Yaling*: I want to find the rules*

Hilary: *But it’s hard*

The following indented exchanges overlap*:*

 Yaling: *It is hard. Always to break the rules*

Hilary: *Actually, not what you think about that. It is another rule, right?*

Yaling: *We should to think outside of our frame*.

Hilary: *Uhhuh. Also, I have think about some elephant, [unclear: freezing?] elephant, do you remember that*?

Yaling, *yes, yes* [unclear: freezing?] *elephant*

Hilary: *This is very common in China*

Yaling: *Yes, of course, very common. Like today* [pointing at powerpoint], *peer pressure? Like what we learned today. We’re often influenced by others. Even if we know this is not the right thing, we need to do, but* [Hilary and Abda nod their agreement, Hilary: *Bystanders*]

Sam: *But I thought this is our culture’s problem, but now I think it’s more like human nature’s …* [laughs]

Hilary*: I mean, like the* [unclear: *freezing*?] *elephant actually happen in anywhere, but I think especially* [Sam: in our culture*] in my work experience, actually that is somebody just* [Yaling: *Really?*] *not – just ignore that, although it is there.*

Sam*: Ignore what?*

Yaling: *Maybe they want to, like, they want to, like come to the resource quickly, so they have to ignore something that might – very –*

Sam: *Can you give some example?*

Hilary: *Yes. In a company, every company have different rules. You know that. Yes. So everybody should obey that rules. Although sometimes it may be wrong. It’s not correct, in some extent.*

Yaling: *But it is like, like today, peer pressure? Or - what we say?*

Hilary: *I think not the same one. Yeah, because bystanders, that means you support everybody’s ideas, right.* [Yaling: *bystanders*] *But maybe that is in society. I mean, I have the experience about that, maybe in company it is very obvious* [Yaling: Mmm] *Yeah, like some, some, some rules in the office.*

Sam: *Ahh*.

Yaling: *Yes, I know, I know that. Trust me, I know that. There are some rules that – in, uh, insuh* [searches for words]

Sam: *In society - or*

[Yaling still searches for the word. She says something in Chinese. ]

Yaling: *Inreasonable.*  [Hilary: Yeah, maybe, maybe]. *It is inreasonable. You have to respect your manager, whatever they like you to do, you just need to obey their rules, not to like talk to them, even if it is wrong*

Sam: *But I don’t think it’s the same idea of the elephant in the room.*

Hilary: *I think, it you put it as a rule* [Sam: Ah], *it is like that. Sometimes in the office you don’t, you can’t have some critic, critical thinking, you can’t, you cannot* [everyone talks at once]

Yaling: *You know, there are, one of my manager told me that when we went to the university to – to* – [searches for the English word, says something in Chinese]

Hilary: *Recruit people*

Yaling *Recruit people, and there are some people with critical thinking* [Hilary nods her agreement] but the manager didn’t like them because they think in the office, in their work, they have to obey the rules, not have critical thinking.

Sam: *It’s more like “culture and taboos”* [looking at Hilary]

Hilary: [thinking] *mmm – this is kind of culture but I think this is phenomenon, you can see that.*

Yaling: *This happens everywhere, like -*

Hilary: *Yeahyeahyeah*

Yaling: *Last week we talk about broo – boo*

Sam: *Taboo*

Yaling: *Uh yes, taigoo.*

Kathy: [interjecting] *Taboo*

Hilary: *Taboo*

Yaling: *Taboo*

Kathy: Something you don’t talk about

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Hilary: *Yes, yes*

 Yaling: *Yes, we don’t talk about that*

Hilary: *Yes, exactly.*

Kathy: Had enough? Shall we move on?

1. The students agree. I show them what they said about climate change in the pre-course task:

*Climate change is a result of ... global warming , which is the biggest problem [that] threatens our world. Global authorities should take it seriously and find solutions for this problem, such as, reduction of pesticides … airplanes and plastics. Also, recycle all products.* [Abda]

*I think the earth is like a delicate eco-system ball, which has a stable circulation of wind, land movement and water flows. But [in] recent years, it has … taken too much changing of heat or air composition by human activities. So that some turbulence [is] happening now, which appears as some disaster of nature.* [Sam]

*Very dangerous to human beings* [Hilary]

Yaling joined the group at the last minute to replace a potential interviewee, who was absent, so I didn’t have her response on the screen:

*We are doing some activities that influence the climate and using technology to manipulate weather so the climate is kind of losing balance*. [Yaling]

Sam: *It’s like writing course – lots of mistakes!* [Laughs]

Yaling: [Laughing] *Yes!*

Kathy: So – this is just to remind you what you said before.

I show them the slide with the next questions on it:

Do you feel the same about climate change now?

 If not, how has this changed?

Yaling: [reading the screen] *Climate change … honestly, before I attend to this course, I think climate change just have very serious damage to our life*. [Sam*: Yeah*] *And maybe I was just influenced by the government, or by some – departments. Maybe, they are not so much dangerous, or so much severe about climate change, maybe*. [Sam looks incredulously at the others, covering his grin with his hand]. *Like there are some different people said different things. Some people said it will cause very damage, [climate] change.*

[Sam looks at Hilary and they both laugh, Abda just nods thoughtfully].

Sam: *You mean, you used to be thought that climate change is a big thing, but now, it’s not really –*

Yaling: *Maybe, it is not that big!*

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Sam: *Awww!* [chuckles, looks at the others in disbelief]

 Abda: *OK. OK, OK* [nods, looks like he is taking Yaling seriously].

Sam*: I will keep the same idea about climate change. It’s a big thing, and we –*

Yaling: *But not just influenced by the activities, human activities. Maybe the, the earth movement.*

Sam [Looks at the others, laughing incredulously] *How can you lead to your conclusion – here!* [Chuckles]

Yaling: *Mmm?*

Sam: *What’s the process of your thinking – to this conclusion.*

Yaling: *Before – uh, I’m sorry?*

Sam: Uh (says something in Chinese)

Abda: *Why you said that? Why?*

Hilary: *Why?*

Sam: *Why you change your mind?*

Abda: *Why you change it? Because what? Because some rea-*

Yaling: *There are some surveys about the climate change. The tutor gave us that*. [The others seem to realise what she means]. *There are some different opinions about the climate change. And some departments says it is very dangerous, and we have to change our – ways*, [Sam: *Yes*] *daily ways, or something else, and some say, it is nothing, it is nothing. You have to keep going or something else.*

Sam: *But I think, if they say it’s nothing, maybe it’s not -*

Yaling: *We want to trust, who we want to trust. We want to trust the thing that we want to trust. We trust the thing we want to trust.* [All nod].

Hilary: *I see.*

Yaling: *We trust the people who we believe, he or she is right*. [General nodding]. *So I trust my government, so whatever* [laughs].

Abda: *OK*

Sam: *The government says it’s a big problem*

Yaling: *Yes*

Sam: *Yes*

Yaling: *So I think it’s a big problem. But, maybe it is not that big.*

Sam looks at the others and laughs incredulously, again.

Hilary: *I think that is a serious problem. But, many government have their own opinions. And many governments do as one way, and actually they – they still destroy the environment. Yeah.*

Sam: *They announce something* [Hilary (nodding vigorously) *announce*] *but do something different.*

Hilary*: Like Norway.* [Sam: *Ah, yes*] *They all have oil*. [everyone agrees] *And essentially, yeah - pollute environment.*

Abda: *So, do you feel the same? Or you have changed your –*

Hilary: *Yeah, maybe I have the same idea as before, because -*

Abda: *Yeah, I have the same idea.*

Hilary: *Yeah*

Sam [to Abda]: *You keep the same idea?*

Abda: *Yeah*

Sam: *So, what’s your idea?*

Abda: *Because it was very dangerous, so we are using of chemicals and pesticides and plastics, that cause many problems of our environment* [the others murmur agreement] *and leads to climate change. So this is my opinion before.*

Sam: *Do you want to –*

Yaling [interrupting]: *But now I have a new opinion about climate change* [Abda: *Yeah] if we can develop some technology, to – like, we have to think outside the frame, right?*

Sam: *Ah, uh*

Yaling: [Describing a square in the air and on the desk] *We often think in this frame, or think ’oh, it is so dangerous, the climate change is so dangerous. What if we consider something, some very high technology to –*

Abda: *To overcome this problem -*

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Yaling: *deal with this yeah*

 Abda: *To overcome this problem –*

 Yaling: *Deal with this problem*

 Sam*: I think there are a lot of experts dealing on this problem*

Abda [to Sam]: *Say it again*?

Sam: *There are a lot of experts that are dealing with this problem, they are invention some technique to help deal with the problem. But it still need our* [gestures round the table] *efforts to* [Hilary: Yeah]. *Because eventually it’s the energy we consume* [Abda: *consume, yes*] *that cause lots of problem.* [Abda and Hilary agree; Yaling seems to be disengaged and is fiddling with some papers on the desk].

Abda: *OK*.

Sam: *Yeah, but it is, how to say, strongs my idea that we need some research about how exactly you need to reduce your energy use, or your* [Abda: *energy consumption*] *habit, of like clothes lines or something, or don’t use the – I think it’s also interesting in the class that mentioned the use of cell phones, its influence stronger [general agreement] than reuse the plastic bags.*

Yaling: *So you need to reduce the usage of the phone* –

Abda: *I think very difficult to* [general agreement]

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Hilary*: Yes, yes*

 Yaling: *Yes, it’s so difficult to change*

 Abda: *reduce consumption of [unclear] your mobile phone, or something like that, but*

Yaling: *If you google one time, there will cost a lot of energy when you google* [general agreement]

Abda: *Yes. But if we have alternative solutions, we can use it. But we can’t stop using electricity or -*

Yaling: *We have to find a balance* [Abda: *Yeah*] *about climate change and daily usage or daily consume about energy, we have to find a balance.*

Sam: *And also the*

Yaling: *If we like, take too serious about climate change, we are too fear about climate change, the best way is we close the* [gesturing at the ceiling], *close the, uh, turn off the light, and turn off the phone, and just stay here, or maybe it is better to kill ourselves* [makes a cut-throat gesture, Abda and Sam laugh] *so we cannot breathe* [Abda: *Exactly, exactly, exactly*], *we don’t consume the – air -*

Sam: *But I mean, they should like make a list, what’s the most important thing*

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Abda: *The most dangerous thing to us – causes of climate change*

 Yaling: *I think it’s the balance, we have to find the balance*

 Abda: *I think there’s some research you can read about*

 Hilary: *Yes, but I think – it depends on you*

Sam: *The government don’t release this information to us.*

 The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Abda: *But you can use it now*

 Hilary: *But yeah, I think it depends on you*

Yaling: *Yeah, it depends on you, when you go outside this room, it is your decision whether to turn off the light or not*.

Sam: *No, I mean, I mean what effects the most, like uh*

The following indented exchanges overlap*:*

Abda: *You can, you can look it up. You can look it up.*

 Yaling: *Everything, you can change everything*

Hilary: [unclear: ? *We should say*] *something about some policy* [Abda: *government*], *government should just enforce some policy.*

[Sam and Abda talk at once; unintelligible]

Abda: *But you are now in UK, not in China*

Sam: *Oh* [laughs] *yeah, yeah*.

Hilary*: But actually, if you want to find some information, how to do that, you can find online.*

Sam: *Yeah yeah. I mean* [Hilary and Abda are also talking] *if you want, you can do some extra research about this topic. But I mean it’s like government’s duty to inform us*.

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Hilary: *Yeah, like its policy*

 Yaling: *Yes*

Sam: *Not really policy that force you to do something, it’s like recommendation that what you do*

The following indented exchanges overlap*:*

 Hilary: *Actually, China have*

 Yaling: *They can publish some papers about*

 Abda: *No, I think*

Hilary: *Like recycling things* [Sam: *Yeah, yeah - but*] *that China has recently enforced.*

Yaling: *Yes*.

Abda: *I think you are right. But I think the governments cannot tell the people to reduce the energy consumption, because of economical reasons. So when you* [unclear: *read? agree*?] *to reduce your consumption of energy, [Sam: but you can’t] so government cannot take away* [all express agreement], *cannot earn any money from the people, yeah*.

Yaling: *So, back to the balance, I think we need to find the balance about that*.

Hilary: *You know in China, in Beijing sometimes that is full of pollution, and government enforced some kind of factories*

Yaling: *Factories to close*

Hilary: *Yes, close*

Sam: *Yes*

Abda: *OK, OK we go – off topic!* [others agree]

1. I show the next slides and read out the questions:

Were the topics interesting?

Did you enjoy the activities?

Did you understand what the workshops were about?

Do you think the sessions helped in your study or life?

Yaling: *Yes, of course*

Sam: *Yes*

Yaling: *Yes, of course. We talked about* [heaves a big sigh. Sam laughs]. *We talked so much about that. It really helped me, when I like – it is a good way for me to make friends with other countries, really* [Sam laughs again, then nods: *Yeah]. Like, I have to say, in some Africa countries, they have some* [says a word to Sam in Chinese]

Sam: *Culture? Habits?*

Yaling: *Habits, yeah, habits I think is very hard to accept, like, they have their* [indicates her head, says something in Chinese; the others seem to know what she is talking about]

Abda: *yeah, yeah, yeah, they have some some – yeah*

Yaling: *Yes. And they have* [makes a gesture as if covering her face with a cloth]

Sam: *Make-up?*

Yaling: *No, towel, they have some - towel to cover their face*.

Sam: *Ah*

Hilary: *What?*

Sam: *The –*

Sam makes a gesture as if holding something square in front of his face, but also struggles to find the right words. Then Yaling explains something in Chinese, while making gestures as if her face and body is covered in something.

Sam: *Oh! It’s not Africa*.

Hilary: *It’s Saudi Arabia* [Sam now makes a gesture as if putting on a hijab. Everyone is talking at once].

Abda: *I know*. [Makes a face-covering gesture]. *This for Muslim. Muslim*. [Everyone is talking at once]. *I think this is off topic!* [Everyone laughs].

Yaling: *I think I used to – it is hard for me to accept that. But now I think, they have their reason, they have their beliefs* [Abda and Hilary nod. Abda: Yeah]. *It is the reason why they are doing that. And maybe I have the cultural bias.*

Abda: *OK. I will answer this, because of religious reasons*. [Sam: Ah, yeah. Yes]. *So we can’t change.* [Yaling: unclear: *So you still do critical thinking*] *This is because of religious reasons*. [Sam: Yeah] *So every religion have their own habits to do that* [Yaling: *Yes* (keeps nodding)] *because of religion*. *So if you have your religion, you will follow your religion.*

Yaling: *So I used to have the cultural bias*. [Abda looks quizzically at Sam. [Sam: *So s/he is changing*] *And I am changing* [points to the powerpoint].

Abda: *OK. OK*

Yaling: *I am changing, I am changing, I think. I am taking about*

Abda: *No, no, no. That’s my answer. I just say*

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Abda*: I answer your question*

 Hilary: *He just comments, your answers*

 Yaling: *Oh!* [nods].

Abda*: I answer your question, what, why, so I am answer your question. OK*. [To Hilary] *So what about you?*

Hilary: *Yeah, yeah, I want to answer that question. I think topics are all very interesting. Yeah, I like kind of activities like, we can notice every, every, everything on the wall and sticks, the information stick on the wall* [Abda: *Oh, yeah*], *we can read it, and then write something what do we think in different issues*

Abda: *In different issues, different views, yes* [Hilary: *Yeah, yes*]

Yaling*: I enjoy the class that we can discuss not just listen to the teachers, I really –*

Sam: *But I think it’s normal in -*

Hilary: *Normally we have discussion.*

Sam: *Normally in England or*

Hilary: *Ah, yeah*

Yaling: *But I just around here and,* [Sam: In your] *and my lessons are just listen by the teachers* [Sam: *Ah, respect your*], *we just have the lectures*

The following indented exchanges overlap:

 Hilary: *Different*

 Sam: *Not, uh, similar*

Yaling: *We don’t have similar.*

Sam: *Oh!* [Laughs]

Yaling: *Yes. Till now*.

Hilary: *Maybe, a few years ago. Now I think the education in China maybe have developed.*

Sam: I *mean here, your class?*

Yaling: *I don’t have seminar*. [Sam looks non-plussed, Hilary: *Oh!*] *Even here. Yes, I just have lectures.*

Abda: *Lectures. OK, OK.* [Hilary: *OK*]

Yaling: *Till now, till now. I just [unclear] round here, um*

Sam: *So it’s a taught* [there follows an attempt by Sam to ask Yaling where her Masters is taught or research; Yaling doesn’t understand and he gives up].

Abda: *OK* [pointing at the powerpoint], *so topic is –*

Yaling [interrupting*]: So I think* [Abda: *Yeah, yeah] the lesson is very interesting, the topic is very interesting, because it’s a way* [Hilary and Sam look at each other and laugh. Hilary: *OK*] *for us to discuss.* [Hilary: *OK* ] *OK*.

Abda: *For me I think it was very useful, even now, I can, for example, if somebody said, inform we with some information, so I go to my phone and look it up, and find the source, is it right or not* [Hilary: *Ah, I see], it’s supported by evidence or not [*Hilary*: OK.* Sam*: Yeah], so, used to do that later, yeah. So this is what importance of [unclear] this course.*

Hilary: *Yes, sometimes I can, I can think about what teacher taught us, and then combine with the real life, and have a think, than before, yeah. Before I just, uh, I try to think some method to question some question, but I don’t know some theory, you know, theories [*Yaling*: Mmm.* Abda*: Yeah]. Yes, so I think can’t support my ideas enough. But now, maybe have some sources, yes, for me, yeah, that is good for my thinking.*

Abda: *OK*.

Yaling: *If we know this topics, if we know this theories, maybe it’s really good for us to have the critical thinking* [Hilary, Sam and Abda: *Mmm*].

Yaling: *OK*

Abda: *Next question*

I say we have finished. The students and I express our appreciation for each other’s efforts.