**Transcript of group interview with Portia, Ayşegül and Rose, 22nd November 2019** *(these are all pseudonyms)*

The researcher’s speeches, actions and summaries are in roman text, the interviewees’ speeches are in italics.

I spend a few minutes recapping all the workshops and establishing who went to which ones. Then I show the students the first question on the powerpoint, which is

1. “What is critical thinking?”

Then I show them their own (anonymised) responses to this question in the Pre-Course Task - see below. (Note: these had been slightly edited so students would not be embarrassed by their own grammar mistakes, and so the mistakes would not impede comprehension for the other students).

*When we learn something, we should have our [own] ideas. Not totally accepting. When we meet problems, we need [to] have a structure about how to solve them from different aspects.* [Portia]

*Thinking from many different angles.* [Rose]

*Giving answer of what, why*. [Ayşegül]

Then I show the question: “Has your **definition** of critical thinking changed? How?”

Portia: *I think before, I learned critical thinking courses, I think critical thinking is let me know the answers when we meet the questions, and have lots of ideas, and know what is right and what is wrong. But after the learning, I know the detail. There are many aspects, like the sources, like, uh… I think I can, apart from two parts, intern[al] of myself, and outside the sources, and we should suspect the sources, and also suspect our self-beliefs, our self mind. It’s very important. And sometimes we cannot believe the sources directly, and also we should have a question mind to think about these things.*

Ayşegül: [Nodding] *Yeah*

Rose: *What you say is right, yeah.*

Portia: *What is right?*

Rose: *What you saying is right, and my previous idea is that thinking from different angles, and I’m not change my idea, but to add some explanation of that, to think it’s maybe to think one question from different [unclear: framing?], or to take off my confirmation bias. I think that will be the critical thinking.*

Ayşegül: *And first definition of mine was about, critical thinking is belong to your, ah, your point of view, and you compare the things according to yourself. With this workshop, I understand, how can I say, there have some issues for framing. I didn’t know it was framing, because I’m [*unclear *– relate?] the things according to my life experience, it means the framing. Also, there was something missing about the last workshop we did* [ A. looks like she’s trying to remember something] *um, being the more emotional, or the … I’m not sure it was the right word, to manipulate people, or the – not manipulate, persuade people. Because you are discuss something, and you compare some idea, according yourself, your own, and you have to show something to other people. And you use some methods.* [Can’t express herself further]

I show the students the next set of questions, emphasising that they are different from the question before:

Has your own thinking changed as a result of this course?

If so, how?

What caused this change, do you think?

Portia: *I think maybe there are changes for me. And, like, confirmation bias. I think I benefit for it, a lot. Before, I always think some things I think in my way, and after I learning, confirmation bias, I find I like to observe more information, like uh, before I think women more like to decorate, to dress beautiful clothes than men, but uh, and after that I will observe the people on the street, and many men will dress themselves better. So I think the big change is I’d like to, to change my mind and not [note?] directly what I just see and what I think before.*

Rose: *Because I not think I am really changing my thinking, because I think I always think a lot, before I come this class, and after this class I also think a lot. I can think what is right thing support me and what is against my idea. But I not find out I’m changing, yeah.*

Ayşegül: *About this course, how can I say, my mother always ask me, when I ask a question to her, according to what, what should we compare, or what’s the result of this. With this course, I know the ask the question, what’s the results according to what, but with this course I keep my mind to ask, when I read something, OK, it’s talking about, writing about something, but where is the evidence, and what’s the target of these things? It’s this course gave me this kind of questions to ask, what I think, what I read or what I write.*

Rose: *To have some doubt about where this source comes from, this course can benefit me. Yeah.*

The students ask for the next question. I show the students what they said about climate change in the Pre-Course Task (anonymised):

*This is big question. Climate changes brings many problems to people, animals and plants. According to surveys, researchers [have] said it [is] caused by human activities. So if we want to solve it, we need to find the real reason and make measures to reduce the bad effect.* [Portia]

*It cannot be changed by one or two people.* [Rose]

*Climate changing is normal because there is a science history of climate but the effect of human is really terrible on climate change. We change it unpredictable way. That will affect all of us. For example: east side of States was frozen whereas west side were dealing fire last year*. [Ayşegül]

Then I show them the next set of questions:

Do you feel the same about climate change now?

If not, how has this changed?

Portia: *Now I think climate change is a really big, big question. And, we have lots of aspects we should focus on, and it’s not just one aspect. Like we should, uh, if we want to have further research, we should know the economic areas, we should know the social, or some academic areas*. [Rose: *issues*].

Ayşegül: *I was thinking about climate change before, like the social, not social, it’s the environmental, political and economic issue, with this course I learned another aspect, another framing of the climate change. And I think every issue has more than one – uh, three or four issue, we can frame them according to what we want to talk about. Because some people can use climate change in the political, is a good way, or we have good standards and this is the result of our good lives, others can say as a political [unclear], we destroy our futures. It depends on what you want to say, and climate change is I think the zero point, at the zero point, and we can go to the positive side, or the negative side. I realise that with this [course].*

Rose: *Climate change in this course give me a strong idea of its a very obviously worldwide problem about our modern society. And I only think it was an environmental problem before, but I found it can form as a political or religious issue about it, and it’s great. Yeah.*

The students look for the next question:

 Is there anything else you would like to say about the workshops?

For example:

* Were the topics interesting?
* Did you enjoy the activities?
* Did you understand what the workshops were about?
* Do you think the sessions helped in your study or life?

I go out of the room in case students feel inhibited. (Although Ayşegül murmurs that I will listen to the recording anyway – quite so!)

Portia: *I think this kind of workshop is very useful, very useful than the lessons, compared to my department’s courses. It’s very useful because we can think not only in the academic areas, and it’s useful in the life. And, it’s interesting but sometimes I think in the group sometimes people have the different ideas. And I learn how to understand other people’s, and why they think that, that way.*

Fatamgul: *Topics were interesting, I come this course to increase my critical thinking, if I have wrong thing, if I have knowledge about critical thinking, I want to be said [told?]. It’s, at the end of this course, these workshops, how can I say, critical thinking become more specific in my mind, and I will ask some question, and it’s indicate the, this question, with these workshops*. [Looking at the ppt slide] *“the activities”, yes, I enjoy with these activities. The most interesting part was, we checked the, there was part of the picture, we tried to guess what’s happened [laughing] and there was lot of idea, but it’s not, any idea was about the full picture. It was really enjoyable*. [Looking at the powerpoint again] *“Understand” …? We have to check the* [counting on her fingers] *sources; we have own ideas to tell them; also we should set the framing of the, our idea, it is the important thing.* [Portia: *Yes*]. *It will be good if I attend the first workshops, but I couldn’t. Also, in my “study life” I learn a new word, it’s good, “egalitarian” is the one, it’s a good thing. And “life” I met a lot of people* [indicating Portia and Rose], *that’s the best one*.

Rose: *I think the topics are interesting, but at first it was just a little confusion for me about some, uh, how to identify what is framing, or what is the confirmation bias. It’s a little confused for me. But after all the lessons, after the whole lessons you can understand what the teacher want to tell us. It’s a very enjoyable, and I enjoy some of the activities, especially you saying* [looks at Ayşegül*] to give a part of the picture to guess what is the whole picture. But I think I am a little clever, I know that I see the first picture to, I can guess that was a corner of a party. And I think it’s just a little, it’s – I’m correct on some level, and I understand the workshops about the confirmation bias or something else, and the taboos. Yeah. I was, I think the* [Chinese word, sounds like “gung du”] *is the most happening elephant in this room, or in some room with Hong Kong people or the Taiwan people, yeah.*

Ayşegül: *So, I realise the people who attend this courses is the Asian people [unclear]. And also it’s a good opportunity to learn the how Western people’s thinking* [laughs].

Rose: *Yes, we can learn some how Western people think from Kathy and Mark, yeah. And it’s a good* [unclear *- internal ship*?] *with people from different region*.

Ayşegül: *That’s all!*